

Lauren Hood, MCD
Chairperson
Donovan Smith
Vice Chair/Secretary

Marcell R. Todd, Jr.
Director

City of Detroit
CITY PLANNING COMMISSION
208 Coleman A. Young Municipal Center
Detroit, Michigan 48226
Phone: (313) 224-6225 Fax: (313) 224-4336
e-mail: cpc@detroitmi.gov

Brenda Goss Andrews
Kenneth R. Daniels
David Esparza, AIA, LEED
Ritchie Harrison
Gwen Lewis
Melanie Markowicz
Frederick E. Russell, Jr.

February 9, 2023

HONORABLE CITY COUNCIL

RE: Proposed Capital Agenda FY 2023-24 through 2027-28 (**RECOMMEND APPROVAL WITH MODIFICATIONS**)

On November 1, 2022 the Proposed Capital Agenda FY 2023-24 through FY 2027-28 was submitted to the by the office of the Chief Finance Officer/Budget Department to the City Clerk to be conveyed to City Council consistent with Article 8, Chapter 2 of the City Charter. The City Council, Legislative Policy Division (LPD) and the City Planning Commission (CPC) have been in review of the document since that time. The Commission received presentations at its December 1, 2022 and January 5, 2023 meetings on the proposed Capital Agenda and following additional discussion at it meeting of January 19, 2023 took action Below you will find the Commission's review and actions,

REVIEW

*The CPC reports on the **Housing & Revitalization Department (HRD), Planning & Development Department (P&DD) and Eastern Market.** In review, there are many questions that arise, some because of the vagueness of some of the elements of the documents. Some of HRD's strategic priorities are to increase the supply and quality of affordable housing, to improve housing stability and resident quality of life. They are collaborating with the Detroit Continuum of Care to deploy funds and services to those experiencing homelessness. They are responsible for administering the Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) Program along with other agencies. One of their priorities is fostering a workplace that retains and attracts employees. They have had four (4) affordable housing developments in this last cycle and have used Home CDBG dollars to accomplish that. They were able to complete eight (8) projects, which either created, preserved, or rehabbed affordable units, again using Home CDBG dollars. Eighteen (18) projects are currently in process, including those for retention of long-time, low-income Detroiters in their homes.*

One question that comes up from our review is the stance that the Commission and City Council might take on how CDBG dollars are programmed. The issue of what our (Commission and Council) long-term policy may be when it comes to whether we are looking to fund new construction or if we want to focus those dollars specifically on entities that have existed for a long time in Detroit.

Since the **Planning & Development Department** doesn't own any assets, most of what their budget touches on is the Neighborhood Framework Plans. More specifics should be provided as it relates to the Joe Louis Greenway, its timeline, and where are the next segments that will break ground? Greater detail would be helpful in understanding the disparity in the amount of

money being used on the more recent neighborhood planning efforts vs those that were started years ago.

The **Eastern Market** Capital Agenda Plan speaks to many different capital improvements that are currently underway, i.e., streetscaping, infrastructure improvements, market garden historic site, shed and expansion of their wholesale market and a new shed, Shed X (\$20 million). Greater detail should be provided. This plan seems to propose to demolish Shed 4; but there is not a lot of detail on how they plan to achieve razing and rebuilding Shed 4.

The **Charles H. Wright Museum of African American History** (CHWMAAH) there was a lot of focus on maintaining the museum and conducting overview repairs that had been pushed aside during the COVID-19 pandemic. Repairs of the core infrastructure, mechanical systems, facades, replacing an outdated freight and passenger elevators, etc. They didn't list any identified funding sources for the projects that were proposed to be completed.

General Services, Parks, Public Spaces & Recreation were focused on improvements to existing facilities such as the city parks, recreation centers, Hart Plaza and the marinas and harbors that are third-party operated. Specific projects listed included continued construction of the Joe Louis Greenway, renovations to Rouge, Chandler and Rackham Golf Courses and construction of additional bathroom facilities at the Aretha Franklin Amphitheatre. The Capital Agenda did not address some items that were described in the 2022-2023 Parks & Recreation Strategic Plan. Questions raised included the creation of master plans for each of the regional and riverfront parks as well as the future recreation centers that are described in the Strategic Plan at Chandler and Dexter-Elmhurst.

The **Detroit Historical Society** maintains the Detroit Historical Museum, the Dossin Great Lakes Museum on Belle Isle as well as the Collections Resource Center at Historic Fort Wayne. Some of the recent improvements they have made include replacement of the handicap elevator and loading dock, HVAC system, parking lot, etc. Many are just maintaining the infrastructure and improving the various museums. The current capital project underway is the expansion of the Dossin Great Lakes Museum. Several of the proposed improvements are focused on the Detroit Historical Society, including permanent exhibits, updates to those exhibits, as well as additions to the museum and improvements to both the indoor and outdoor facility.

The **Detroit Zoological Society** operates the Detroit Zoo and the Belle Isle Nature Center. The Kid Zone allows children to engage more with nature and help them to understand what the zoo is about. Improvements around that include the relocation of a habitat to make room for the Kid Zone. The Belle Isle Nature Center recently underwent a complete renovation of the facility which includes several additions that are mainly focused on inter-active experiences for patrons; a bird-viewing window, inter-active children's pop-up display, and a walk-through viewer tunnel.

The **Health Department**, in addition to maintaining their the current Animal Care and Control facility located at 401 Chrysler, is pursuing a new facility at 5700 Russell St. for which \$6.6 million is being allocated. They also maintain their fleet of animal care trucks. We find this submission to be satisfactory.

The **Police Department**, lists the physical properties, the precincts, the parking and storage locations as well as all of the equipment, both hardware and software, that are used by the department. Everything seems to be consistent with the previous submission, but we don't see an accounting of all of the assets. For example, the helicopter could be covered under specialty

vehicles, but there is not specific mention of it with respect to the Aviation Division of the department. We also note a lack of similar recording of tactical vehicles and equipment. Of course, it may be that some are not in the document as it may be sensitive information. The Shotspotter infrastructure that was subject of protract discussion at the City Council, is another example of a known item that is not covered in the Capital agenda.

The **Detroit Department of Transportation (DDOT)** and the **Department of Public Works (DPW)**. For DDOT, the big changes since the last Capital Agenda were that the central administration building was proposed to be closed, but now it's going to house the Paratransit Customer Service and Dispatch Center. The Coolidge Terminal rebuild has advanced. The environmental review is expected to be completed in March. They will demolish the existing building and start constructing the new building. That will need to come for a new rezoning in the next couple of months. The State Fair Transit Center is now in progress. They are installing shelters with advertising on them, which pays for the shelters. Thirty-seven (37) have been installed since the last Capital Agenda and there will eventually be a total of fifty-nine (59). New signage has been installed on nine (9) routes and they plan to replace the remaining signs over the next five (5) years.

The notable changes in **DPW** since the last Capital Agenda are the continuation of the streetscape projects throughout the city. Current projects under construction are E. Warren and Rosa Parks and W. Warren. Speed hump construction continues with a projection of 10,000 completed by the end of this construction season, which is the total amount since they started in 2018. They have allocated \$2 million to improve Eliza Howell Park and Roadway in this fiscal year. \$37.5 million has been allocated to implement the Save Streets for Detroit Plan to reduce crashes, injuries, and fatalities on city streets. \$770,000 for new and replacement cameras to target illegal dumping. Federal Highway Administration grants to the City are improving safety and connectivity of neighborhoods targeting the Riverfront and Livernois/McNichols area for an automated driving system grant that will be administered between DPW and the Office of Mobility.

Also, the Rosa Parks Transit Center is receiving \$2.7 million in rehabilitation and noted that the Transportation Department must do something to make sure that this facility is maintained constantly give the incredible amount of traffic it must accommodate.

The **Coleman A. Young International Airport** is implementing of a newly completed airport layout plan, which is an overall master plan for the airport property. The layout plan is required to be approved by the State and it was approved by Michigan Department of Transportation (MDOT) in September 2022. The layout plan includes a ten-million-dollar investment, engineered material arresting system (material to stop aircraft that may over run the runway), and the design and construction of a new Taxi Way B (\$8,800,000). Additional improvements with estimated costs to be determined include decommissioning/removing Runway 725 that would create up to 80 acres of developable property on the west end of the airport, site selection design and construction of a new air traffic control tower, the removal of the Airport Executive Terminal Building and other structures, and safety improvements that support vehicle taxiing, fueling, loading and unloading aircraft and constructing additional hangars. Most of the funding for these improvements would be through the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) funding.

The Municipal Parking Department's main priorities are to optimize the effectiveness of on-street parking enforcement, improve the efficiency of on-street and off-street parking availability, to support the city's law enforcement in parking related concerns and to influence

the overall public-private parking system to maximize usage, reduce congestion, limit environmental impact, and facilitate economic development.

Notable changes since the last Capital Agenda is a new parking lot added on Livernois containing 75 spaces, which they are leasing from New Prospect Baptist Church. They are currently operating 800 new parking meter kiosks, up from 500 two years ago. They are planning new fencing and stone surfacing improvements to the Caniff tow yard. Planning to replace license plate reader equipment in their 48 enforcement vehicles, replace signs and meters in surface parking lots in 10 commercial corridors; and replace the revenue control systems for the parking garages. One concern we had was that the Residential Parking Permit Program is not listed in the Capital Agenda.

The **Detroit Transportation Corporation (DTC)** known as the **People Mover**. This is another transportation project that utilizes federal funding. There is a significant investment proposed with replacement of all twelve (12) train cars with either new or refurbished used cars, an investment of \$50 million. One question is if that number could be refined further, i.e. if all of the cars replaced are new the number would be close to the \$50 million but if they use a combination of the refurbished, the number would be lower. Other improvements include the rehab of two electric substations that supply the People Mover, the installation of cameras, passenger calendars and replacing and upgrading the onboard passenger communication systems. Replacing and upgrading of the original fare collection equipment in all thirteen (13) stations allowing full integration with other transit providers and city payment systems. They are also pursuing upgrades to the software that runs the system and other related software.

The Commission discussed the desire city to have a seamless, integrated transportation system throughout the city, from busing, MoGo's to the Q-Line with lower costs and more frequency and reliability across the board. There are a variety of options we have with this money that our city and our citizens desperately need. In 2019 the Detroit People Mover operated at a loss; ticket revenues were in the realm of \$1 million with operating expenses around \$22 million. Most transit systems operate at loss, but maybe this deserves closer examination to ensure the money's are being spent most effectively to ensure Detroiters' needs are being met.

The **Department of Innovation & Technology (DoIT)**. DoIT has made great strides building the city's infrastructure and its web presence and providing general IT support to all of the city's various agencies. They were able to meet the challenge when it came to converting the city to a work-from-home or remote operation and the renovation of the Committee of the Whole to support remote meetings. There is an ongoing effort to do the same in the Erma Henderson Auditorium. We don't find anything out of the ordinary in their proposal, which continues to support the City's current and emerging needs.

The **Department of Elections**, continues its efforts to improving the ballot processing modules, equipment and software for absentee ballots and processing.

General Services Department (GSD) has over 200 facilities, which include municipal buildings, fire department, police department, service yards, recreational facilities that they have set aside monies to maintain. There are six (6) buildings the city is focusing on for GSD facilities improvements. GSD is also in charge of the city fleet and their goal is to make sure that departments have access to reliable vehicles for general city operations, public safety vehicles, building department.

The **Public Lighting Authority** (PLA), there was an initial effort to replace a lot of the LED lights, and some are coming up for renewal. Monies are set aside to continue to remove legacy poles, LED light replacement, moving power underground for 22 blocks.

The **Public Lighting Department's** (PLD) main focus is to continue to decommission PLD and to transfer it over to the Authority. They plan to set aside \$2.6 million in the next three years to remove thirty-one (31) PLD substations and are prepared to decommission Mistersky (the City's power generation facility). Our questions include are there any environmental contaminations associated with those substations? Some substations will be put up for sale and they will have to be cleared of the mechanical equipment.

The **Detroit Water & Sewerage Department** (DWSD), is about 21% of the total of the Capital Agenda, an amount not different than seen in previous cycles of the Capital Agenda. DWSD is responsible for 2,700 miles of water distribution mains, 3,000 miles of combined sewer infrastructure, 5,700 miles of water and sewer piping, 95,000 catch basins, 34,000 sewer manholes, 30,000 fire hydrants and 40,000 valves that need to be maintained and upgraded. New categories in the Capital Agenda are \$69.3 million being aimed at replacement of lead service lines on a city-wide basis. The American Rescue Plan Act (ARPA) has provided funding which the department is allocating towards basement back-up protection. Funding solutions targeted at eleven (11) specific back-up prone Detroit neighborhoods, including Jefferson-Chalmers. There is \$23.4 million for far westside storm water improvements; \$117 million in allowances for the sewer program; and, \$19.4 million for various green stormwater and infrastructure programs.

The projects included in the **DEGC's** Capital Agenda are all currently underway. There was no five-year plan with future projects, nor a Capital Agenda provided by DEGC. The projects in progress included four (4) categories: industrial, land assembly, infrastructure improvements, Eastern Market, and manufacturing business attraction. DEGC discussed the Eastern Market Project, redevelopment of the Fisher Body Plant and street improvements for the infrastructure improvements projects such as Mt. Elliott, Sherwood, and Dubois Streets. The report included some out-of-date information that seemed to be copied and pasted from the 2020 Capital Agenda.

The **Detroit-Wayne County Port Authority** outlined the improvement of the Port Authority's Office and Cruise Ship Dock. Nothing more was provided.

The **Detroit Riverfront Conservancy's** specific goal is to develop the riverfront district and facilitating community access to the waterfront. The projects listed included the construction of a new riverwalk connection from Ralph C. Wilson Park at Rosa Parks Blvd. to Riverside Park.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The City Planning Commission, generally speaking, finds the proposed capital improvement projects and related information contained in this proposed Capital Agenda to be a somewhat sufficient representation of the City's capital needs and corresponding plans. However, our review does reveal several omissions of information that should be included as required by the Charter, information that in some cases is known and otherwise documented. This raises the concern for the omission of information/projects that are not readily known. As noted in the November 28, 2022 LPD report and the staff presentations received by the Commission, the chief omission is the

removal of the Detroit Public Library from the Capital agenda, which has been a consistent component in the past. There is also a question as to why the QLine is not also include among our Affiliated Agencies in order to represent more fully transit undertakings and the impact within the Woodward right-of-way. Similarly, information in the GSD Parks and Recreation Strategic Plan, and projects such as DPD's Shot Spotter do not appear to be represented.

The CPC having completed its review of the proposed Capital Agenda 2023-24 to 2027-28 recommends approval with City Councils satisfactory consideration the following questions, concerns and modifications:

- The Detroit Public Library, the QLine and other similarly situated agencies that should be included in the Capital Agenda be added.
- Housing and Revitalization
For the five-year plan HRD has 19 capital improvement plans scheduled for 2023-24. Those projects have a total value of \$45M. There are multiple new construction projects utilizing CDBG dollars During the 2022 CDBG NOF deliberation both the City Planning Commission and the City Council took issue with the recent practice of performing new construction projects under the PFR (Public Facility Rehab) category limiting available dollar for traditional rehab. The CPC recommends that clear consistent policy be developed for these activities and that new construction projects compete under a separate category from PFR.
- Planning and Development
 1. The projected Phase 4 cost of the Neighborhood Planning Studies is quite low compared to the first two phases. Are these initiatives to be supported with the same resources as the first? Will staff play a greater role than in the past thus resulting in lower consultant costs? Will the Scope of Services differ greatly from past?
 2. Vacant School Stabilization is to utilize \$2.5 million. Is tactical preservation or incremental rehab of significant resources being considered as a part of the stabilization effort in order to help bring these buildings back online?
 3. What are the potential areas planned for phases 5&6 of the neighborhood planning. Has Council weighed in? How are these areas determined?
 4. What are the next phases of the Joe Louis Greenway implementation?
- Eastern Market
 1. \$30M has been earmarked for the replacement of Shed 4 "replacement. How is this envisioned to take place? Is the existing structure proposed to be razed? Or, will there be some reuse of the existing structure given that this building is within an Historic District. Has there been any coordination with or evaluation by the Historic District Commission staff?
 2. \$20M is proposed the development of Shed X. Where will it be site? What is the design program for the structure?
- General Services Department – Parks, Public Places and Recreation
The Parks and Recreation Division of GDS recently completed the Parks and Recreation Strategic Plan, which includes its own capital improvements section. The plan speaks to a number of items not addressed in the Proposed Capital Agenda such as the need to create master plans for each of the regional and riverfront parks, or two future recreation centers. CPC recommends that that the provisions of the Proposed Capital Agenda be reconciled with that of the Parks and Recreation Strategic Plan.

- *Health Department*
 1. What is the status of the of the 2nd mobile clinic the Department sought to purchase under the previous capital agenda?
 2. What is the condition of the Animal Care and Control vehicular fleet? Will replacement vehicles be needed over the five-year period?

- *Detroit Police Department*

The five-year plan identifies five projects totaling \$62.5 million of which one is for bullet proof vest and the other pertains to more facility improvements. There are three items that are not specifically referenced in the plan that would seem to warrant some detailing. They are the helicopter, tactical equipment and Shot Spotter. The CPC recommends that some detail of these items be added given their prominence to the department in recent years,

- *Coleman A Young International Airport*
 1. A \$10,000,000 investment is proposed in a new Engineered Material Arresting System (EMAS). The Proposed Capital Agenda identifies this project as maintaining an existing asset. It is unclear if this EMAS project should be tied to the runways and taxiways asset (maintain) or should be considered a new investment/asset that does not currently exist for the airport, which appears to be the case. It may be beneficial to clarify this for asset/project tracking purposes in the future.
 2. Three major projects, the decommissioning of the crosswind runway, the new air traffic control tower, the removal of the executive terminal and other structures are presented without cost estimates. What are the hindrances with making these cost projections and including them in the document?

- *Department of Transportation*

Does this reflect all the Departments eligible activities? Are there other activities that stem from community engagement and Planning processes that have been identified, but not included in this proposed capital agenda?

- *Transportation Corporation*
 1. The Proposed onboard camera and communications project is identified as maintaining an existing asset. It should be verified that this project and funding would only apply to existing or rehabbed train cars, not new replacement train cars. If new replacement train cars come with the desired communication features, this project would not appear to be needed for new cars.
 2. The previous Capital Agenda includes Fare Collection as an asset for replacement as a major improvement over the next five years. No recent major improvements have been made and this asset is described as being at its end of life. For the Proposed Capital Agenda, it should be considered if New Investment is a more appropriate project type than Maintaining Existing Asset if the fare collection system would be disposed of and completely replaced.
 3. It should be verified in the Proposed Five-Year Capital Plan table if System Management Software is tied to the SCADA asset or a different asset as that is currently unclear.
 4. It should be clarified if the proposed automated train controller component upgrades would constitute a replacement/new investment of this asset, or maintenance of an existing asset that may have previously been replaced as part of the previous Capital Agenda.
 5. It is unclear how/if the proposed estimated cost of \$50,000,000 for train car replacement would account for the possibility that replacement cars could include an unspecified combination of new and refurbished used train cars. It may be beneficial to address how/if the estimated cost could vary based on this unknown combination of new and used cars.

6. The previous Capital Agenda does not include Trucks in the Description of Assets table. It should be clarified which asset the Truck Overhaul project is under or if this is a new asset type not previously considered for funding.
 7. Looking at the system comprehensively, the Commission desires a more seamless and better coordinated transit system linking motorized and non-motorized options. The Commission also raised the delicate question of the sustainability of the Detroit People Mover. Given the many needs that exist across the City, should we continue to make this sort of investment in the People Mover? At some point the People Mover should fully assessed to determine what improvements or alterations would make it a more sustainable system or when it may reach the end of its life cycle.
- General Services Department - Facilities
CPC staff is concerned about the consolidation of service yards and garages. Which ones will be kept? What are the plans for the facilities/properties that are to be disposed of?
 - Public Lighting Department
 1. Is it known if any of the 31 substation sites contain any environmental contamination due to their operation over the past decades. If so, what type of contamination? Are funds allocated to address this?
 2. Does the disposal of Mistersky include demolition of the entire building; does it include any potential remediations? What is the City planning regarding the future use of this site?
 - Detroit Water And Sewerage Department
The CPC recommends that the Capital Agenda prioritize capital expenditures to facilitate the removal of the “flood plain” designation that burdens property owners with flood insurance premiums and prevents allocation of CDBG funds to flood zones, such as Jefferson-Chalmers.
 - Detroit Economic Growth Corporation
The information provided by the DEGC is both out of date and not really reflective of capital planning. CPC Staff recommends that the information be updated and that DEGC
 - Detroit Wayne Port Authority
The Port Authority should include information pertaining to it other capital assets including the Port of Detroit.
 - Detroit Riverfront Conservancy
DRFC should add information pertaining to the condition of it other capital assets.

Respectfully submitted,

LAUREN HOOD, CHAIRPERSON



Marcell R. Todd Jr, Director
CPC Staff

Cc: Antoine Bryant, PDD Director

Steven Watson, Deputy CFO/Budget Director
Donnie Johnson, Associate Budget Director
Hakim Berry, COO
Sam Krassenstein, Director of Infrastructure
Donald Rencher, Group Executive for Housing Planning and Development